# Nomadic Ethics in Contemporary Women's Writing in German

Strange Subjects

Emily Jeremiah



### Copyright © 2012 Emily Jeremiah

All Rights Reserved. Except as permitted under current legislation, no part of this work may be photocopied, stored in a retrieval systom, published, performed in public, adapted, broadcast, transmitted, recorded, or reproduced in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

First published 2012 by Camden House

Camden House is an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Inc.
668 Mt. Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620, USA
www.camden-house.com
and of Boydell & Brewer Limited
PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DF, UK
www.boydellandbrewer.com

ISBN-13: 978-1-57113-536-0 ISBN-10: 1-57113-536-7

## Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

IDDIN 1-3/113-330-/ (Hardcover, acid-free paper)	ISBN 9/8-1-5/115-556-0 (hardcover: acid-tree paper)	Includes bibliographical references and index.	p. cm (Studies in German literature, linguistics, and culture)	subjects / Emily Jeremiah.	Nomadic ethics in contemporary women's writing in German: strang	Jeremiah, Emily.
--	---	--	--	----------------------------	--	------------------

German literature—Women authors—History and criticism.
 Austrian literature—Women authors—History and criticism.
 Women and literature—Europe, German-speaking.
 National characteristics, German, in literature.
 National characteristics, Austrian, in literature.
 Gender identity in literature.

7. Postmodernism (Literature) 1. Title. PT167.J46 2012

830.9'9287--dc23

2012032213

This publication is printed on acid-free paper. Printed in the United States of America.

#### Contents

Index	Bibliography	Conclusion	5: Facing the Other: Barbara Honigmann and Jewish Nomadic Ethics	4: Uncanny Returns: Anna Mitgutsch's Austrian Nomadic Postmemory	<ol> <li>Disorientations: Queer, East German Nomadism in the Work of Antje Rávic Strubel</li> </ol>	2: Creature Comforts: Economadism in the Work of Dorothea Grünzweig	1: Seeing Strangely: Birgit Vanderbeke's Ways of Knowing	Introduction: Developing a Nomadic Ethics	Acknowledgments
219	203	199	165	132	98	63	29	<del> </del> -1	Vii

# Introduction: Developing a Nomadic Ethics

writers conceptualize contemporary German speaking women ties—especially but not only gender identities—in ethically instructive ways. The writers—Birgit Vanderbeke, Dorothea Grünzweig, Antje Rávic Strubel, Anna Mitgutsch, and Barbara Honigmann—reveal how factors such as sexuality, ethnicity, religion, and disability affect the status and comfort of the subject. They problematize the categories of gender and nation, revealing them to be artificial and restrictive—though still pertinent and influential—and they suggest more inclusive and navays of framing identities in a postmodern, globalized era. They propose methods of conceiving contemporary subjectivity that account for fluidity and mobility while also acknowledging the material, the everyday, and the relational. I term their various strategies "nomadic" and view their work as ethically significant.

Why ethics? Ethical inquiries are in fact unavoidable, since, as John D. Caputo puts it, "Obligation happens." Obligation toward others is an inescapable given that requires expression. The current ethical turn in theory both points up and reflects on this given. Arguably, ethics is especially urgent in the German-speaking context. Sander L. Gilman writes of the new Germany's "self-consciously ethical" confrontations with the past, suggesting that morality is a conscious concern of many recent German debates. This is a logical development if one accepts his contention that twentieth-century German history, more than the history of any other nation, demands the production of ethical accounts of the present and the future. I will return shortly to the key questions of Germanness and Austrianness.

What can feminist ethics contribute to the project of producing new values and visions? Feminist ethicists assume that the subordination of women is morally wrong and that the moral experience of women is as deserving of attention as are male constructions of morality. To foreground writing by women, and especially its ethical implications, is to champion these tenets. It is to insist that an adequate account of contemporary German-language literature and culture pay due attention to women. It is also to demand that any account of ethical behavior encompass feminine models of knowing and being. This project ties in with the feminist insight that moral theory has traditionally privileged male views of ethical behavior. Carol Gilligan's landmark study of 1982, *In a* 

Different Voice, notably made this case. Gilligan evokes a feminine ethic of care that revolves around a central insight: "that self and other are interdependent." This ethic stands in opposition to masculine accounts of morality that privilege reason and logic over emotionality and empathy. Feminist ethicists assert "our fundamental relatedness" and take affective responses as a basic fact of human existence. As Margaret Urban Walker stresses, "Morality is fundamentally interpersonal."

In the postmodern context, ethical ideals, especially those that appeal to feminine kindness, might feel outdated. First, they may seem essentialist, positing "women" as a group about which one can generalize. If gender is "performative," as Judith Butler famously argued — a matter not of being but of doing — is it meaningful to talk of "women" as a category at all?8 The theory of performativity does not deny sex, however. As we will shortly see, recent feminist thought has usefully expanded on Butler's notion of performativity, more forcefully introducing materiality as a salient factor in the construction of the subject. I will come back later to the question of materiality and the category of "women."

emphasized the difficulty of relationality and the effort it demands. They of women or care. Noddings points out the feeling of doom that can argues, "Morality . . . consists in practices" (10). She challenges the way argues that men can practice "feminine" care ethics. 10 One should not fact no angel, nor is she confined to the so-called private sphere. gests that morality is inherently political. 12 The angel in the house is in door --- or the stray teenager at the front." Il Feminist theorists have thus stranger. . . . She would prefer that the stray cat not appear at the back accompany responsibility: "The caring person . . . dreads the proximate ings. Furthermore, feminist ethics largely eschews romanticizing views mative view of ethics frees it up from such universalizing understandcontextless, universal facts about 'human' nature or life" (27). A performoral philosophers tend to view relationships and behaviors as "timeless. fixity. We need rather to see morality as a question of doing. As Walker conflate sex and gender, then, or view ethical behaviors as a matter of as guardians of morality, angels of the house.9 Nel Noddings, however, have also stressed the political implications of ethics. Joan C. Tronto sug-Second, such writings as Gilligan's may appear to reinscribe women

Third, any discourse about ethics might seem pointless in an era of playful relativism. Postmodernism, as it is widely understood, privileges plurality and dissonance over unity and coherence, an ethically risky move. <sup>13</sup> If judgment and consensus are merely residual signs of an outdated modernity, how do we decide what is good? But such concerns are misplaced, for the postmodernist subject is not, and cannot be, utterly unfixed. For one thing, she is not alone. Her performances are always relational, as Butler establishes in connection with gender: "One does not 'do' one's gender alone. One is always 'doing' with or for another, even if

the other is only imaginary." <sup>14</sup> And as Robert Eaglestone observes, while postmodernism is often associated with playfulness, pastiche, and irony, in fact it involves a "central and consistent commitment to ethics." <sup>15</sup> As I will show further now, a feminist ethics is especially apt for our times.

### Braidottian Nomadism

The work of Rosi Braidorti brings together feminist-ethical ideals of connectedness and ideas concerning mobility and border crossing, offering a useful framework for an ethically motivated exploration of texts by migrant or mobile women writers, such as those considered here. Braidotti's 1994 Nonnadic Subjects introduces a conception of subjectivity as embodied, mobile, and in process — this in opposition to previous philosophical understandings, which stress unity and rationality, or "the perversely monological mental habits of phallocentrism." In the 2006 book Transpositions: On Nonnadic Ethics, Braidotti expands on the ethical implications of this theory of subjectivity, as we will see.

Nomadic Subjects discusses the so-called crisis of modernity, but takes issue with the notion there is a crisis. Instead, Braidotti views the challenge to the Enlightenment tradition as an opportunity for feminism to develop different understandings of subjectivity (NS, 97). <sup>17</sup> For example, Luce Irigaray's work manifests a "radical novelty," articulating a feminine corporeal reality never before represented (NS, 130). <sup>18</sup> Braidotti also rejects the idea of the death of the (female) subject, pointing out that one cannot deconstruct a subjectivity that one has never achieved (NS, 141). <sup>19</sup>

Braidotti herself presents a figuration, that is, "a politically informed account of an alternative subjectivity" (NS, 1). Nomadism is a style of thought. It does not denote actual moving about, then: a crucial point as far as this study is concerned. It is, rather, "the kind of critical consciousness that resists settling into socially coded modes of thought and behaviour" (NS, 5). Braidotti does however assert the importance of actual mobility, noting that it constitutes a real achievement for women (NS, 256). She also avers that "real-life women" need to occupy positions of discursive power (NS, 174). At the same time, though, Braidotti is careful to assert "freedom of the mind" as equally important as literal freedom of movement (NS, 256). One way of putting it is this: You don't have to be nomadic to think nomadically, but it helps. <sup>20</sup>

Nomadism expresses a desire for an identity made of transitions and shifts, one lacking in and opposed to an essential unity. It thereby represents a form of political resistance to "hegemonic and exclusionary" views of subjectivity (NS, 23). Nomadism does not, it should be noted, entail incoherence and unboundedness. Rather, it combines coherence with mobility, possessing a cohesion that is produced by "repetitions, cyclical

moves, rhythmical displacement" (NS, 22). Nomadism does not involve a jettisoning of borders, then, but an acute awareness of the nonfixity of boundaries (NS, 36). Braidorti takes inspiration from Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, in particular from the Deleuzian notion of "becoming." The Deleuzian image of the rhizome as a figure for nonlinear modes of being and becoming is also key. The rhizome stands in opposition to aborescence, that is, fixed, roored ways of thinking and living (NS, 23).<sup>22</sup>

However, Braidotti is also critical of Deleuze. She makes clear, for example, that becoming is always sexed, upbraiding Deleuze for failing to see that neutralizing sexual difference can only hamper the project of reclaiming female subjectivity (NS, 122). Deleuze's notion of "becoming woman" actually entails desexualization, she argues, noting that "only a man would idealize sexual neutrality" (PD, 108, 121). Braidotti herself insists on sexual difference and embodiment. For her, feminism is the question, and the affirmation of sexual difference is the answer (NS, 77). Against feminist assertions of constructedness, Braidotti insists on matter and bodiliness:

in order to make sexual difference operative as a political option, feminist theoreticians should reconnect the feminine to the bodily sexed reality of the female, refusing the separation of the empirical from the symbolic, or of the material from the discursive, or of sex from gender. (NS, 177)

Braidotti thus advocates materialism, viewing the body as a point of intersection between the physical, the symbolic, and the sociological, and making a case for what she terms "embodied and historically located subjectivities" (NS, 4, 123).

#### Materialism

Braidotti's materialism forms part of a broader tendency in recent feminist thought: the new materialism, material feminism, or the material turn in feminist theory. The editors of the 2008 volume Material Feminisms, Stacy Alaimo and Susan Hekman, note that materiality has constituted a "volatile site" for feminist theory, which has preferred to take refuge in the domains of culture, discourse, and language. <sup>24</sup> The "linguistic turn" in feminist theory has been productive but has, they claim, led to an impasse. The constructivism that poststructuralist and postmodernist thinkers espouse has led to a dismissal of the real/the material (MF, 2–3). Butler's performativity, for example, has attracted criticism for allegedly overlooking the material. <sup>25</sup> Butler's powerful and productive understanding of gender as performative is important since it gets over the sterile sex/gender opposition in feminist theory, or the

"tired social constructivism versus essentialism debates," as Karen Barad puts it. <sup>26</sup> It posits a view of both sex and gender as constructed, or performed, where the subject is implicated in its own constitution and is not simply a blank slate upon which culture inscribes itself.

manist performativity" that takes account of the nonhuman, as we will see asserts. Barad herself contends that matter matters, proposing a "posthudiscursive practices seem to hang in the air like the persistent smile of the contends that in Butler's work "questions about the material nature of is limited by its exclusive focus on human bodies and social factors, and tualize nature itself. Barad argues that Butler's conception of materiality that is, as practicing agency, they also suggest that we need to reconcepment (MF, 4). Drawing on Barad's understanding of nature as agentic ence, corporeal practice, and biological substance" require acknowledgtalk about the materiality of the body as an active force; "lived experidivides.<sup>27</sup> Alaimo and Hekman similarly hold the view that we need to ied subjectivity and in challenging the mind/body, representation/matter Moira Gatens, and Genevieve Lloyd are interested in theorizing embod ers as Adriana Cavarero, Braidorti, Christine Battersby, Elizabeth Grosz further in chapter 2. Cheshire cat. "28 Butler fails to recognize the dynamism of matter, Barad But as noted, Butler underplays materiality. In contrast, such think

## Nomadism: Critiques and Qualifications

a style of thought that takes account of the local, the bodily, and the culture and at the same time in huge disparities and structural inequali we like it or not, displacement is a central feature of the postmodern and the quotidian. 31 However, Braidotti's nomadism is a figuration and dition. Mobility does not always spell freedom. The question "who can agency, one that stands in opposition to "the inertia and self-interests of ties. Braidotti's nomadism offers a new conception of the subject and of at self-perpetuation and results in the homogenization of commodity is headless yet hegemonic, mobile yet fixed, global and local; it aims by advanced capitalism extending beyond the nation-state. This order era. We are operating now in the context of globalization, characterized material. And for all that these factors have not disappeared, whether ied subject . . . (still) inhabits places," and is implicated in the materia travel?"30 Is nomadism even possible? Elizabeth Boa and Rachel Palstay at home?" is sometimes more pertinent than the question "who can Actual, literal nomadism is not necessarily a privileged or favorable con-Gabler, for example, is suspicious of the idea of "happy nomadism."29 freyman remind us that "nomads require passports." For the "embod-Braidotti's nomadism has encountered skepticism. Gisela Brinker-

due respect to Ahmed's corrective or warning points, especially as far as the phrase "strange subjects" as the subtitle of this book, as a way of 88), and her warnings influence this study. I have therefore opted for observe that "home" is also a site of strangeness and movement (SE, sion on Braidotti's part. She argues that this very gesture serves in fact ples and nomadic thought conceals the privilege inherent in the latter notes that Braidotti proposes a certain kind of subject, one that is the specificity and difference of particular nomadic peoples.<sup>32</sup> Ahmec the idea of home is concerned. light Braidotu's nomadism in my main title but through the subtitle pay further defining the nomadic subjectivity that I am investigating. I highto go beyond fixity actually serves to fix (SE, 84). Ahmed is right to to shore up conventions and boundaries, and suggests that the desire free to choose. She suggests that the analogy between nomadic peophor, Braidotti makes them something other than themselves, crasing Strange Encounters, Ahmed argues that in using nomads as a meta-Sara Ahmed raises a further objection to Braidotti's concept. Ir 83-84). Ahmed also problematizes the privileging of transgres-

give "material support" to the home's dwellers. This is not a romantically is intrinsically valuable (FB, 138). The activities involved in homemaking to individual lives through the arrangement and preservation of things view of housework — as fostering male subjectivity while denying that ever, while such thinkers as Simone de Beauvoir offer an entirely negative gives rise to a "privatist identity" that can lead women in particular to ties). Young also discusses the central position occupied by house and (a male domain) is privileged over care and maintenance (female activi pointing to its gendered nature. She observes that even today, building ambivalent entity. Young explores the Heideggerian notion of dwelling, of women for the sake of nourishing male projects"33 - it is a deeply to reject home as a value - given that it has meant "the confinement it. Iris Marion Young observes that while feminists have good reason denoting entrapment and passivity, we cannot, and should not, discard essentializing view, for: of the women who perform it - Young suggests that giving meaning isolation and anxiety concerning appearances and status (FB, 133). Howhome in the consumer consciousness, noting how the stress on ownership houses and other structures remains largely a male activity. Construction For while the category of home has been problematic for women

shifting. (FB, 140, 143) the material changes of age and environment make lives fluid and present . . . There are no fixed identities, events, interactions, and anchors it in physical being that makes a continuity between past and Home as the materialization of identity does not fix identity but

> meaningful things. She notes usefully that the concept of home does not that make the political possible" (FB, 149). set personal and political in opposition, but instead "describes conditions Young suggests that we should revalue and degender the preservation of

## Sara Ahmed's Ethics of Encounter

to the postmodern context.34 claim that postmodernism consistently and crucially involves a commitmodernism and ethics are opposed to each other, citing Eaglestone's individual others — occur? I have already challenged the view that postment to ethics. I also suggest that feminist ethics is especially well suited how can rooted (or rhizomatic) engagements - to communities and to responsibility toward the other? If the postmodern subject is nomadic. If home is a site of care, is nomadism a renunciation of such care, of

extend them, in particular by expanding their ethical potential. of Jean-François Lyotard and Emmanuel Levinas, through the lens of marginalization, she reads canonical postmodernist texts, such as those often subordinates or excludes feminism. In opposition to this perceived erence point or meaning. 35 She argues that the term "postmodernism" modernism can paradoxically serve a hegemonic function. It is a way of bears such writings out, but rather in how it can complement, enrich, or feminist theory. She is interested not in how feminism merely relates to or bringing "differential and contradictory phenomena" back to a single ref this claim. In Differences That Matter, she notes that the idea of post-Sara Ahmed develops a postmodernist feminist ethics consistent with

particular by stressing specificity and encounter as key to ethical behaviors rary." It would not draw on "universal judgement"; instead, judgments motivate not a discarding but a rethinking of procedural issues and reguunethical. Ahmed, in contrast, argues that we need to develop new forms of modernism with the demise of the ethical (DM, 45). Lyotard's notion of would come about through "specific engagement" with others (DM, 57)logue, entailing ethical decisions that are "inventive, partial, and tempo could be a matter of (always unequal, but nonetheless unpredictable) dia ing femininity a site of critical refusal (DM, 54). Ethics, Ahmed speculates Such values help dislodge the universalism of previous moral theories, mak femininity — care, connectedness, bodiliness — can assist in this project lative structures (DM, 50).36 The values that have traditionally oriented consensus. The postmodernist critique of universality should, in her view, opposition in place (DM, 48). Lyotard assumes that consensus is itself problematic, since privileging difference over totality means keeping the "paralogy," of ethics as produced by dissension rather than agreement, is These suggestions echo other work by feminist ethicists, as we have seen, ir Addressing ethics, Ahmed writes critically of the conflation of post-

to get closer to others," through effortful "strange encounters" (SE in this connection. The stranger, Ahmed points out, has become a par tion of the idea of the stranger in postmodernism, criticizing Braidott encounter with others" (SE, 7). Ahmed also casts doubt on the fetishizathan one' of the encounter: the designation of an 'I' or 'we' requires an claims, are formed through "the very work that we need to do in order for a "politics that is premised on closer encounters." Collectivities, she 4). Against both universalism and cultural relativism, Ahmed is calling adigmatic figure, cut off from the histories of its determination (SE relationality when she claims, "Identity . . . is constituted in the 'more analyses that follow. 180). The idea of the strange encounter will serve as a touchstone in the Ahmed expands on these ideas in Strange Encounters. She asserts

## Knowing Others: Braidotti and Butler

subject is in fact a necessary precondition for an ethics suitable for our relativist despair, Braidotti claims here, a nomadic, nonunitary view of the complex times (T, 18). Braidotti also explains: nomadism, provides another key point of reference. Far from leading to Braidotti's Trunspositions, which develops the ethical implications of

sense of interconnection between self and others, including the non-A sustainable ethics for a non-unitary subject proposes an enlarged individualism. (T, 35) human or "earth" others, by removing the obstacle of self-centred

nectedness in framing an ethical view of the subject, a move in keeping chapter 2. Here I would like to highlight the importance of interconductivity and progress."37 culture that stresses, as its bottom line, an unlimited concern with pro important to emphasize the importance of human connectedness "in a fying tendencies of global capitalism. As Tronto argues, it is especially stands in opposition to "self-centred individualism" and the commodiwith feminist ethics more broadly. A relational conception of the subject I will explore the question of nonhuman and "earth" others further in

otti with a source of inspiration as she develops an oppositional model of being and knowing: "Transposition," a term used in music and genetics, furnishes Braid

a theme (textual or musical), but rather of playing the positivity of not just a matter of weaving together different strands, variations on difference as a specific theme on its own. (T, 5)the sense of a leap from one code, field or axis into another . . . It is It indicates an intertextual, cross-boundary or transversal transfer, in

> otti explains, nonlinear but not chaotic, nomadic yet accountable and embedded, and coherent without falling into instrumental rationality committed, creative but cognitively valid, discursive yet materially Like nomadism, then, this figuration valorizes difference. It is, Braid-

self exists only in relation to other selves, and any dyad is also conditioned the "other" is widely posited as an entity "out there," it is in fact very in . . . the intersubjective encounter;" as explored especially by Emmanuel unexamined" in critical discourse, and it seems to have "lost its moorings comparably that the term "the other" is widely used but "remarkably draws attention to the "other" within (GA, 84). Steven Shankman notes Butler suggests, the source of one's ethical connection to others, for it to turn against it as a project" (GA, 46). The foreignness of oneself is However, even though self-knowledge is limited, "that is not a reason nerability and our essential sociality (GA, 33). Narrating the self involves ing on the work of Adriana Cavarero, Butler asserts our fundamental vuland mediated by language and by social norms and conventions. 38 Drawidentity formation. In Giving an Assount of Oneself, Butler notes that the close, even within Levinas, whose work features in chapter 5.39 As Butler also implies, while fabulation, since one can never know what has preceded one (GA, 37)Butler provides a complementary way of conceiving ethical, relationa

## Nomadic Ethics: Summary

and both natural and cultural. A nomadically ethical stance is opposed modes of becoming. It presupposes a view of the subject as embodied mative, conservative thinking, and a commitment to open-ended, radical thought, to the denial of difference, to violence. to rapaciousness and domination, to rigid and exclusionary forms of ongoing, and always mediated. It entails the refusal to be fixed by nor-It promotes engagements with others in relationships that are effortful Nomadic ethics involves the acknowledgment of difference and specificity

highly significant and charged German-speaking context, in which notions of home and belonging are texts do not only thematize nomadic ethics, they also practice it, as i acknowledge and celebrate materiality, home, and relationality. The the risks and uncertainties of postmodernism. At the same time they fluidity and mobility inherent in the era of globalization as well as for discussions of literary texts that follow. As I have argued, the writers will shortly argue. The challenges they pose are especially potent in the ler's incomplete yet urgent account of the self: these ideas inform the I explore all suggest ways of conceiving subjectivity that allow for the Braidotti's nomadic ethics, Ahmed's strange encounters, and But-

## Nation, Germanness, Heimat

Other prominent theorists of the nation, such as Ernest Gellner and Eric and hold that there is no such thing as an essential national identity Fulbrook and Anderson thus take a constructivist approach to the nation point here is not to distinguish between false and genuine communities, ined — and perhaps even those, for all relationships are mediated. The what Benedict Anderson famously termed the "imagined community" of situationally variable."41 This set of patterns emerges in and gives rise to cultural, social and political patterns that are historically malleable and struct. Mary Fulbrook describes being German, for example, as "a set of not exist as an essence to be identified and defined; it is, instead, a constructions that may be reinforced or challenged. National identity does torical nor fixed. Rather, nations are social, political, and cultural conism, an example of the normative, conservative thinking alluded to above Hobsbawm, share this vision. 43 This study adopts a similar view. lages, in which every relationship involves face-to-face contact, are imagthe nation. Anderson observes that all communities larger than small vil-The nation-state is in fact a modern phenomenon. 40 It is neither ahistingent and contextual nature, and it stands in opposition to national but rather to consider the style in which communities are imagined. 42 Nomadism ties in with theories of the nation that stress the latter's con

What does this construct, "nation," involve? Self-professed nations do not have to be homogenous ethnic groups. Rather, they can rest on shared ideals and goals. The United States is an example of a nation constructed very largely in that way. The nation, in general, depends on a myth of collectivity. Certain narratives reinforce it: the myth of a common past, the idea of a communal destiny, and the notion of shared positive values and of common enemies. 44 The idea of nationality is often very powerful, inspiring extreme feelings and actions, including self-sacrifice. 45 Consciousness of national belonging is a notable modern phenomenon. Nationalism, which arises from and propagates the centrality of nation, is fundamental to collective identity in the modern era. 46 Yet it is founded on a myth and its power rests on shaky grounds. There is a striking dissonance between "the enormity of the influence of the national idea" and "the arbitrariness of national identities themselves." 47

The fantasy of nationalism is a worthy and popular object of scorn. As Anderson points out, it has produced no great thinkers (*IC*, 14). At the same time, however, one cannot simply argue it away.<sup>48</sup> The related phenomena of nationalism and the nation exist and need recognition and analysis. The extraordinary power of the nation is not necessarily always destructive, either. Concepts of national identity do not inevitably involve or encourage right-wing extremism. National identity is, as Stephen Brockmann puts it, "a socially constituted fact" that sometimes has

positive and sometimes negative consequences.<sup>49</sup> Julia Kristeva therefore suggests that the time has come to pursue a critique of the national tradition "without selling off its assets." Rather than rejecting the notion of nation outright, then — assuming that to do otherwise would be to collaborate with pernicious forms of nationalism — we need instead to acknowledge its continuing existence and importance, for all that it may be "past its peak." As Leslie A. Adelson notes, "Some proclamations of the postnational are simply premature." Some proclamations of the postnational are simply premature."

a nation in which the very concept of the nation is subject to question globalization are factors that together render Germanness uniquely trouclaimed in 1990 that Germans question the sources of their national idenstructions of Germanness, 53 it no longer holds weight. Celia Applegate bled and tricky. 54 Germanies in 1989/1990, European integration, multiculturalism, and identity. The legacy of National Socialism, the reunification of the two While the myth of a shared origin might once have been important in coning, quizzical condition. Attempts to define German national identity many offers a fascinating case study in terms of constructions of national this claim; in 1999, he termed Germany a "postnational nation," that is: tity more than any other people in Europe (NP, 246). Brockmann echoes have been central to much of postwar German politics and public debate. (LG, 192). Because of this self-consciousness — and its causes — Gerfact defines contemporary Germanness; Germanness now is a question-Consciousness of the malleability and variability of nationality in

rejection of the "other," which it nevertheless, inevitably, contains withir through covert or overt exclusion of the different and alien. It involves of lixity and precluding radical change. For them, Heimat comes about an intrinsically conservative value, resting as it does on nostalgic fantasies ing" according to Boa and Palfreyman. 57 Boa and Palfreyman view it as signifier in German culture, an imagined site of safety connoting "shel cal — discourse about place, belonging, and identity [in Germany]" (NP has long been "at the center of a . . . moral --- and by extension politisustaining of, an idealization of nation or homeland. The idea of a sta teredness and harmony" according to Blickle and "security and belong perceptions that is all-pervasive and "everywhere." 56 Heimat is a floating 4). Peter Blickle agrees that Heimat is a crucial aspect of German selfthe question of Heimat, a trope or fantasy that according to Applegate phenomenon of Heimat. Indeed, no discussion of Germanness can avoid from global complexity.<sup>55</sup> Such nostalgic conservatism is evident in the ble or normative Leithultur appeals to some, apparently offering a refuge On the other, they have in some quarters prompted a return to, or a the elasticity and flux of the nation as a category, as Brockmann implies These challenges have on the one hand forced Germans to confron

the need for the security Heimat appears to provide. 59 reasserting themselves steadily, as Applegate suggests (NP, 246). The Germany especially, provincialism and consciousness of Heimat have been formative element of German culture (H, 151). In postunification East notion has continuing relevance, as Blickle asserts. For him, it remains a of "the diverse materials" of a provincially defined society (NP, 19). The "shock of globalization" to the Berlin Republic as a whole has heightened formation of the idea reveals the struggle to create a national identity out "a nation of provincials." Applegate observes that the survival and trans torical moments, often serving to yoke together what Applegate terms The term Heimat has functioned in different ways at different his

maintaining, shaping, or challenging imaginings of nation and self. will argue shortly that literary texts represent one method of producing not of our experiences, but of our fantasies about those experiences."62 I it. 61 And as Sander L. Gilman has observed, "We imagine ourselves into thus founded on "extremely slippery terrain," as Andreas Huyssen puts sive — "social, imagistic" — construction and play. National identities are the construction of (German) identity — regional, national, and global Blickle even claims that *Heimat is* identity, "manifested in a social, the world and are constantly reimagining ourselves. We are the collection imagistic way" (H, 66). Identity, in this view, is a shifting site of discurdemonstrates the difficulty of disentangling the many factors involved in antinational construct that paradoxically has always served to support a broad and not clearly defined nationalism (H, 47). And Heimat connotes ship between Heimat and nation, observing that in conceptualizations of opposed to the global. Blickle usefully points out the complex relationregionalism as much as, or indeed more than, it does nation. 60 It thus Heimat "the modern nation-state . . . seems not to exist." Heimat is an However, one cannot see Heimat as standing for the national as

process of the particularization of the universal and the universalization porary identities and cultures, 67 where global and local stand in a rela-Local/global encounters are key factors in the construction of contem of the particular," poses serious challenges to the nation as a category.66 tionship of "mutual interconnection and interdependence."68 Indeed globalization, which Roland Robertson describes as "the twofold tria, like Germany, is grappling with multiculturalism and globalization contests.<sup>64</sup> As well as dealing with its difficult post-1945 legacy,<sup>65</sup> Ausin chapter 4. Like Germany, Austria has undergone painful memory Austrianness is similarly unfixed and troubled, as will emerge more clearly underlie German intellectual and cultural life in the coming years (LGdefining its cultural identity.<sup>63</sup> Austria, too, is a nation in transition, and 191). Anne Fuchs views Germany as a "threshold culture" on the brink of identity. Brockmann predicts that the problem of Germanness itself will It is obvious that there is no answer to the question of German Adelsor

> and global frameworks" of today, a challenge this study seeks to meet. 69 analysis" that have prevailed since 1945 and the "facile . . . transnational consequently urges us to reject both the "nation-centered paradigms of

#### The Female Migrant: Unsettling Nation, Unsettling Gender

and fixity of individual national cultures. Migrants undermine, relativize, spawned, fresh treatments of Germanness.72 In particular, Turkish-German literature and culture have offered, and migrants to Germany, for example, has received much critical attention.71 its potential to challenge or construct forms of nationality. Writing by is a valid and appealing object of critical attention precisely because of and indeed generate national cultures.70 Culture produced by migrants ies between them. It is troublesome to those who insist on the purity On a literal level, movement between nations challenges the boundaraccounts of the subject, especially nationalistic or masculinist narratives Nomadic women writers are well placed to challenge rigid and normative

perspectives arising from this multiplicity and hybridity. Such subjects — "strange subjects," as I term them — can offer new styles of community, clashes of different cultures and histories."74 people who move about "confront . . . the experience of multiple reveal strangeness to be relative. For as Brinker-Gabler expresses it. ance."73 In inhabiting different surroundings, the writers I examine here expose and explore familiarity as a matter of habituation and of familiarity. Ahmed observes, "The familiar is an effect of inhabitany other act, leaving Germany holds the potential to question that are engaged in a particularly potent challenge. Perhaps more than away from Germany, or who thematize such a move in their work plantation involves a challenge to the familiar, to the very category home means ... when we leave home," Sara Ahmed notes. Transhomeland. Departing can grant new perspectives: "We learn what nation's status as both a magnanimous host country and a desirable But what about migrants from Germany? Writers who move

tity is unstable and emerges through "multiple encounters between those who assume themselves to be natives and those recognised as strangers, as "originary . . . intact" realms. 76 Ahmed notes similarly that national identhat falsely implies that cultures are static and homogenous and posits son reminds us. Adelson problematizes the idea of migrants, such as Turkish migrants to Germany, occupying two worlds, a rhetorical concei between inside and outside, terms that are shifting and relative, as Adelties. 75 The nation arises from outside, then, or from an encounter ingly being produced from the perspective of disenfranchised minori Homi K. Bhabha indeed suggests that national cultures are increas

identity is not a question of stable, unified individuals defining themselves independently of others. Rather, it is shifting and relational, as a nomadic as opposed to apparently unshakeable realities. She also emphasizes the of nationality, and on the power of perception ("assume"; "recognised" out of place" (SE, 101)77 Ahmed is careful here to insist on the instability encounter as crucial in the constitution of national identity. That is to say,

term "nation" points up its connection with the idea of birth, or natality women's collusion with fundamentalism or fascism ("WT," 34). The very us to space: home, native soil, motherland (matrie)" ("WT," 33-34). capacity for birthgiving and their confinement to particular spaces: "The bearing out Kristeva's thesis. "a certain conformist maternalism," is dangerous, potentially leading to The consequent linkage of nationalism with feminism, or at least with biological fate that causes us [women] to be the site of the species chains constructs that connote fixity. Kristeva draws a link between women's has historically represented an anomaly, "Woman" and "nation" are (for example, Braidotti, NS, 256), then the figure of the mobile female the private sphere and with passivity, as numerous feminists have shown permanence. If Western culture has traditionally associated women with The female migrant is especially unsettling to ideals of stability and

of subjectivity, and claim that women are both of and not of the nation.<sup>79</sup> problematic relationship to the modern nation-state and its construction nationhood. They assert that as "excentric subjects," women have had a Moallem also note the contradictoriness of women's position vis-à-vis at several points in this study. Norma Alarcón, Caren Kaplan, and Minoo and on the other an opening up of possibilities: a tension that will surface the world."78 This assertion implies on the one hand disenfranchisement, ship to the nation is uneasy. As Virginia Woolf puts it, "As a woman I have enfranchisement, or lack of a place in the nation-state. Women's relationfemininity, and migration illustrates appropriately women's historical disno country. As a woman I want no country. As a woman, my country is And yet displacement or exile arguably form intrinsic elements of

she disregards or playfully relativizes becomes even more disruptive, challenging not only the idea of feminin-"hegemonic masculinity."82 Seen in this light, the female border crosser The constructs "nation" and "gender" often work together to legitimize sized the woman as mother, rendering motherhood a national task.81 and 'womanhood.'"80 For example, National Socialist discourse emphations of nationhood usually involve specific notions of both 'manhood' der are constructs that often overlap and support each other: "Construcdifferences and hierarchies. Nira Yuval-Davis shows that nation and genity as passive and domestic, but also the masculinity of the nation, which The nation asserts and maintains sexual (as well as racial and other)

> notes, and observe that according to such imaginings, women are merely sitional move. Blickle notes that conceptions of Heimat connect to the "part of the package of hearth and home" (H, 26). freyman refer to the "womb-like security and warmth" that Heimat conescape from self-conscious, alienated adulthood (H, 130). Boa and Palforeign or strange) with the masculine, with going out into the world ciated with the feminine, with confinement to the home; Fremde (the the feminist analyses alluded to above, Blickle claims that Heimat is assotionship between Heimat and the feminine, which he sees as closely "class and gender interests" of a male ego (H, 71). Examining the rela-(H, 86). It offers, then, a refuge to the masculine subject, the promise of brates "the shining bride or shining motherhood" (H, 82). In line with related constructions, Blickle asserts that Heimat represents and cele-Blickle's study of Heimut makes clear the necessity of such an oppo-

session of the cultural meanings of femininity themselves (PG, 43-44). As way to investigations of the feminine other, often associated with nature many. In particular, she traces the crisis of Enlightenment and the emerlinguistic signs" (NS, 190) Braidotti suggests, women are "both the effect and the manipulators of male appropriation," for in the post-1945 period women are taking pos-As she notes, however, the feminine is no longer "passively available for maternal love, and nature (PG, 13, 40, 37) -- as in Heimat narratives. jections, the woman standing for unselfconscious wholeness, restorative the deployment of the feminine as a receptacle of male longings and proredemption of the self or of history" (PG, 35-42, 43). Paul thus points to women, such as fluidity, bodiliness, eroticism — in their search for "the gence of the "other" sex in post-1945 German thought. Enlightenment wide-ranging yet nuanced treatment of gender in twentieth-century Gerfigure of the woman — or at least to qualities traditionally associated with Paul demonstrates how male writers and thinkers turn repeatedly to the understandings of the self — as rational, disembodied, masculine — gave tives on Gender in Post-1945 German Literature, Georgina Paul offers a broader tendencies in thinking about gender. In her 2009 study, Perspec-Such gendered discourses concerning Heimat reflect and underpin

masculinity is characterized by rationality and heroic autonomy, and femininity by emotionality and dependence.<sup>83</sup> Against such a backdrop, both East and West Germany, and that of postunification German society, the German migrant woman is still unsettlingly independent, and if she gender order of European modernity." In this order, as already implied was and is "marked by the legacy of the bi-polar, naturalized bourgeois Germany, Claudia Breger claims that the socio-symbolic imaginary of relevance in today's Berlin Republic. Analyzing gender in contemporary writes, even more so The associations and oppositions that Paul traces hold continuing

to this task Their fluidity makes them ripe for contestation.85 Nomadic texts are up nor are they stable objects of knowledge that one can easily pin down.84 renewal. Gender and nation, apparent monoliths, are not in fact fixed factors, being eternally challenged, always up for reappropriation and about through encounters. They overlap with each other and with other Gender and nation are thus relational, shifting constructs that come

## Nomadic Women's Writing

natives to established common sense.90 consciousness" (NS, 15). Literature has to do with the proposal of alterwriting in the nomadic mode involves just such innovative exploration a "reservoir of imagined alternatives," 88 This description is similar to the lizing commonsensical meanings, deconstructing established forms of It is a matter of "disengaging the sedentary nature of words, destabi "surveying, mapping, even realms that are yet to come."89 For Braidotti, Deleuzian view that writing is not a question of representation but of offers visions of possible futures, constituting, as Axel Goodbody puts it, irony, it can revolt against normative or totalizing explanation.87 Fiction example nationalist narratives. By deploying ambiguity, irresolution, and Bird argues, fiction can trouble dominant, rigid accounts of identity, for particular.86 Literature can also oppose nationalism, however. As Stephanie literature has historically played a key role in German self-definitions in new technology helped produce a sense of simultaneity and community establishment of the modern nation. In combination with capitalism, this Anderson, the development of a technology of communications in the eighteenth century — that is, of the printing press — is crucial to the with others. Literature and nation are bound up with each other. For national and gender identities, and in fostering ethical connections (IC,46). Literary texts thus affirm notions of national belonging. Indeed, Literature plays a key role in constructing, or deconstructing, both

overlapping terms. They can also enable encounters between individual encounters between the global and the local, where these are shifting to literary production and reception. 91 Writing and reading can enable encounters through which, following Ahmed, identity comes about. (shifting, overlapping) subjects, promoting and illustrating the strange forms. She also suggests that "glocalization" is a suitable term to apply pleasures of a globalized world. Beth Linklater links the "systemic insta-Literature is also a medium or activity suited to the challenges and associated with globalization to playful, postmodernist literary

light and celebrate strange encounters. If, like Braidotti, one insists on the pose challenges to normative accounts of nation and self, and to high-I suggest that nomadic women writers are particularly well placed to

a stable group, the "opposite sex." ificity, the differences between them, and challenges the idea of women as them. In fact, close attention to female writers actually exposes their specing" might appear to homogenize women, erasing differences between about women's writing as a category. However, the term "women's writimportance of sexual difference, one should have no problem in talking

feminism" means isolation and hence vulnerability for women (T, 45). subversive and necessary now, if one accepts Braidotti's view that "postthe importance of literature to feminism historically. It is also especially community of women readers is a powerful figuration, especially given alert, questioning, ready to be provoked. Haines and Littler's imagined topics pertinent to them. Criticism arguably always posits an ideal reader. women readers who are potentially able to recognize certain trends or might view this as "strategic." Haines and Littler posit a community of such a body were homogenous, quantifiable -- risks essentialism, but we identity, and power (CW, 6). The reference to "women readers" — as if raise important questions of concern to women readers," such as agency Margaret Littler declare that the risk of ghettoization threatening their study of contemporary women's writing in German, Brigid Haines and project is one worth taking, since the texts they examine "collectively . . . The term might also lead to ghettoization, one might protest. In their

would — and yet to devote a book to women's writing is a problematic in this introduction. acts as a kind of testing ground for the materialist feminist ethics outlined able, if they yield interesting and persuasive conclusions. My own study but I suggest that certain readings of certain groups of texts are justifidefinable. In fact, I avoid any totalizing claims about the nature of either gests that the terms "woman" and "women's writing" are graspable and move, or having one's cake and eating it, as Lyn Marven puts it. 93 It sugis constructed, or, following Butler, "performed" - as I most certainly (NS, 187), a term that is constantly changing. To argue that femininity of materialism, Braidotti concedes that "woman" is a shifting significa More pressing still is the issue of constructedness. For all her espousal

"woman" while fully aware of its baggage, both celebrating and chal female subject" (NS, 187). Following this suggestion, I use the word stock of cumulated knowledge, the theories and representations of the come to strategic definitions of the term "woman" by drawing on "the "metabolic consumption," explaining: lenging — testing out — its associations. Braidotti refers to this tactic as This venture is in keeping with Braidotti's proposal that feminists

Metabolic consumption attacks from within the stock of cumulated ture we are in. Women need to re-possess the multilayered structure images and concepts of women as they have been codified by the cul-

9

Braidotti thus makes clear that there is no space beyond culture, only the potential to contest it from within. In accordance with her exhortation, I am here engaged in an act of cultural repossession, as, indeed, are the writers under discussion.

#### Mapping the Terrain

"If one can talk of fashions in an area as sturdy and unfrivolous as Germannistik... the present vogue undoubtedly is a focus on multiculturalist concern and specifically 'minority literature' in Germany." Diana Orendi's claim is valid. German studies has been increasingly concerned with ideas of difference and alterity, and with the discovery and investigation of "other Germanies." Migrants to Germany like the writers Herta Müller and Libuše Moníková have given rise and contributed to such investigations. Turkish-German culture and writing offer an important focus for scholars in German studies. For example, the writer Emine Sevgi Özdamar has received significant critical attention. The gendered nature of Germanness has also emerged. I hope to contribute usefully to this growing body of work on nationality and gender, to which my project owes its existence.

even violent, at its best it can illuminate and enhance readings of literquestion remains: why do criticism? While criticism can be artificial sion of what constitutes identity."98 I agree with this assertion, but the argue for one theory of identity, but rather to show the ways in which means of theoretical and historical analysis. Bird does not wish to is "qualitatively different" from definitions of identity arrived at by views literary discourse as offering an understanding of identity that tionship between theory and literature is complex and contested. Bird the theories of Ahmed, Braidotti, and Butler in particular. The relaity, and representation (CW, 7). Marven goes further, suggesting that relate to contemporary debates about issues such as gender, subjectivrather to use theory as a way into them and to show how the texts cal" (CW, 1). Their study does not seek to foist theory onto texts, but that "the study of literature is in fact always in some measure theoreti do not attempt to "have the last word" (CW, 7). They also remind us present readings of texts that they hope are "authoritative," but that (with which others can then disagree). Haines and Littler consequently ary texts. And in order to do criticism, one needs to offer a narrative "in its own terms extends our intellectual and emotional comprehendifferent theories may elucidate a text. She argues that narrative fiction My approach is informed by theory: that is, by my readings of

a reading of literature through theory should be at the same time a reading of theory through literature. 99

Drawing on the nomadic ethics outlined above, this study will apply theories to literary texts and at points also apply literary texts to theories. This is a comparative enterprise, involving cross-cultural transpositions. Petra Fachinger argues that given the growing diversity of German culture and literature, traditional critical approaches are no longer adequate. She advocates comparatist readings while acknowledging the need to focus on particular cultural dynamics. <sup>100</sup> Similarly J. J. Long, noting the mobile character of concepts in the humanities, stresses "concrete engagement with specific texts" as a way of keeping cultural specificity firmly in mind. <sup>101</sup> This study attempts to do justice to specific texts and authors, even as it riskily draws parallels between German-language writing and (mainly) English-language theory. This move is in keeping with the border-crossing "strange subjects" it encounters.

This book explores the work of five women writers who live, have lived, or live partially outside Germany and the German-speaking countries, and whose work thematizes and explores this displacement (though not exclusively). This definition of the writers' positionality ("live, have lived, or live partially") points to the difficulty involved in fixing the notion of migration, which can denote a short- or long-term process and may involve a back-and-forth movement between countries. I began this study aiming to discuss writers who lived outside of Germany, but the waters quickly became muddied and I was usefully instructed in the messy contingency of both life and letters.

it is this acknowledgment of the authors' specificity - my critical "strange encounter" -- that leads me to address the work of each writer in turn and 5 especially), the author is not dead; she is alive in complex ways. Indeed ence and the subtleties of its expression" (CW, 5). As we will see (in chapter attempt to give an adequate account of each involve a narrowing of focus - this because of "the diversity of that expenested here in work that deals exclusively or explicitly with migration, with think nomadically, but that it helps. On a related note: I am not only interlived experience and literary expression (in autobiographical texts) does not am not squeamish about experience or biography, however. Haines and Litconsciousness, resistant to settling into set codes of thought and behavior. and to the view expressed earlier that one doesn't have to be a nomad to gard experience as a category. I refer here to Braidotti's stress on locatedness tler provide a helpful reminder here. They suggest that the close link between actual movement. Rather I am interested in nomadism as a form of critical be seen to suggest) about nomadic subjectivity and ethics. This is not to disretheir work suggests (or — allowing for critical violence — can convincingly interested in the writers' actual circumstances. Rather, I am interested in what I will both have my cake and eat it when I state that I am not necessarily Chapter 1, "Seeing Strangely," focuses on the work of Birgit Vanderbeke (b. 1956), who moved from the German Democratic Republic (GDR) to West Germany as a child, and who since 1993 has lived in the south of France. The chapter argues for a view of Vanderbeke as a postmodernist writer par excellence: self-conscious, playful, citational. However, Vanderbeke's works are also concerned with ethical relations with the other. Thus her work illustrates and proposes a postmodernist nomadic ethics. It also thematizes and practices a nomadic way of knowing, challenging the distinctions between knower and known, and subject and object, to present an epistemology of interconnectedness.

Chapter 2, "Creature Comforts," explores the work of the German poet Dorothea Grünzweig (b. 1952), who has lived in Finland since 1989. The chapter draws links between nomadism and ecocriticism to identify in Grünzweig's poetry what I term "economadism." Drawing on Ahmed's feminist postmodernist ethics and on ideas concerning epistemology and translation, the chapter argues for the ethical potential of nomadism and of poetry in postmodernism. It also traces a shift in Grünzweig's work toward a greater interest in animality, one that accompanies a corresponding trend in Braidottian ethics.

Chapter 3, "Disorientations," explores the work of Antje Rávic Strubel, who was born in the GDR in 1974. Strubel has lived in the United States but is now based in Potsdam. However, she spends significant amounts of time in Sweden. The chapter sets Strubel's work in the context of recent debates concerning postunification East German identity. It defines Strubel's work as "nomadic" and "queer," and suggests that its combined challenge to nationalism and heterosexism is productive and important.

Chapter 4, "Uncanny Returns," deploys Marianne Hirsch's 1997 term "postmemory" to explore the work of the Jewish Austrian writer.

Anna Mitgutsch (b. 1948). Mitgutsch lives in Austria but has spent much time in other countries, especially the United States. The chapter identifies in Mitgutsch's work a nomadic postmemory, one that is pertinent and potent in the Austrian context. It also traces Mitgutsch's concern with disabled, female, and Jewish others, a concern that heightens the ethical force of her work.

Chapter 5, "Facing the Other," investigates the work of Barbara Honigmann, who was born in 1949 in the GDR, leaving that state for West Germany in 1984. She now lives in Strasbourg, France. The chapter explores the idea of Honigmann as a representative writer, exposing the dangers of such a view. Drawing on Honigmann's own understanding of literature as a site of (self-)recognition — itself inspired by Levinasian ethics — I explore how her work practices a Jewish nomadic ethics, a vital gesture in the German-speaking context.

The conclusion draws together the findings of the five chapters, summing up the diverse strategies employed by these writers as they develop their nomadic visions. It considers the very nature of contemporary German studies. If "Germanness" and "nation" are no longer viewed as stable or valid categories, what are the implications for the discipline? Finally it links the question of nomadism to contemporary attempts to highlight the value of the arts and humanities, arguing that these are potential sites of ethical "strange encounters."

#### Notes

<sup>1</sup> John D. Caputo, Against Ethics: Contributions to a Poetics of Obligation with Constant Reference to Deconstruction (Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1993), 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Karalin Orbán, Ethical Diversions: The Post-Hobeanst Narratives of Pynchon, Abish, DeLillo, and Spiegelman (New York: Routledge, 2005), 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sander L. Gilman, "Introduction: Two Hundred and Fifty Years after Goethe's Birth, Fifty Years after the Aspen Conference, Ten Years after Reunification," in A New Germany in a New Europe, ed. Todd Herzog and Sander L. Gilman (New York: Routledge, 2001), 10, 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Alison M. Jaggar, "Feminist Ethics: Projects, Problems, Prospects," in *Feminist Ethics*, ed. Claudia Card (Lawrence: UP of Kansas, 1991), 97.

S Carol Gilligan, In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development (Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1982), 74. For a good introduction to Gilligan's writings, and responses to them, see Rosemarie Tong, Feminine and Feminist Ethics (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 1993), chap. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Nel Noddings, Caring: A Feminine Approach to Ethics and Moral Education (Berkeley: U of California P, 2003), 49, 4.

Margaret Urban Walker, Moral Understandings: A Feminist Study in Ethics (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2007), 10 (hereafter cited in text). For a useful overview of feminist ethics, see Michelle Mattson, Mapping Morality in Postrar German

- <sup>8</sup> Judith Butler, Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity (New York: Rourledge, 1990)
- 9 See Emily Jeremiah, Troubling Maternity: Mothering, Agency, and Ethics in 2003), 14. Women's Writing in German of the 1970s and 1908s (Leeds: Mancy/MHRA.
- 10 Noddings, Caring, 8.
- 11 Ibid., 47
- (New York: Routledge, 1993), 6-7 12 Joan C. Tronto, Moral Boundaries: A Political Augument for an Ethic of Care
- a discussion of the possible death of postmodernism and the successors in line study. I understand it here as connoting the death of grand narratives, that is to replace it, see Alan Kirby, "Successor States to an Empire in Free Fall," Times play; and a conception of the subject as constructed, shifting, and in process. For to say, of totalizing accounts of the world; a stress on discursive competition or <sup>13</sup> A full discussion of the term "postmodernism" is beyond the scope of this Higher Education no. 1949 (2010): 42–45.
- 14 Judith Butler, Undoing Gender (New York: Routledge, 2004), 1
- 15 Robert Eaglestone, The Holocaust and the Postmodern (Oxford: Oxford UP,
- temporary Feminist Theory (New York: Columbia UP, 1994), 2 (hereafter cited in 16 Rosi Braidotti, Nomadic Subjects: Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Con
- rary Philosophy, trans. Elizabeth Guild (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), 5 (here-17 See also Rosi Braidotti, Putterns of Dissonance: A Study of Women in Contempo
- 18 See Luce Irigaray, "When Our Lips Speak Together," trans. Carolyn Burke, in Cornell UP, 1985). This Sex Which is Not One, trans. Catherine Porter with Carolyn Burke (Ithaca:
- Ian Buchanan and Claire Colebrook (Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2000), 10. 19 See also Claire Colebrook, Introduction to Deleuse and Feminist Theory, ed
- point," offering a "privileged epistemological and political vantage point." Rosi minoritarian" — a reference to Deleuze — but that position is a "great starting <sup>20</sup> Or as Braidotti puts it: "You do not have to be an empirical minority to become Braidotti, Transpositions: On Nomadic Ethics (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2006), 133 (hereafter cited in text as T)
- ing." Understanding Deleuse (Crows Nest: Allen and Unwin, 2002), 33. Braidotti <sup>21</sup> Claire Colebrook explains that for Deleuze: "life is dynamic and open becom Braidotti, Patterns of Dissouance, 109 meant as a multiple and constant process of transformation" (NS, 111). See also asserts: "The Deleuzian becoming is the affirmation of the positivity of difference,
- 22 See Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattan, A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia, trans. Brian Massumi (London: Continuum, 2004), 7. Deleuze

- and Guattari note, for example: "Thought is not aborescent, and the brain is not
- to see that a form of sexual neutrality which does not allow for the fundamental <sup>23</sup> Braidotti adds: "One must be identified with a masculine position in order not lack of symmetry between the sexes will only damage women and the specificity
- Susan Hekman (Bloomington: Indiana UP, 2008), 1; on terminology, see 17-18 n. 3 (hereafter cited in text as MF). <sup>24</sup> See Stacy Alaimo and Susan Hekman, "Introduction: Emerging Models of Materiality in Feminist Theory," in Material Feminisms, ed. Stacy Alaimo and
- 25 See also Brigid Haines and Margaret Littler, Contemporary Women's Writing in text as CW); and Butler, Gender Trouble German: Chauging the Subject (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2004), 11 (hereafter cited in
- glument of Matter and Meaning (Durham: Duke UP, 2007), 64 26 Karen Barad, Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entan-
- body, not just retrospectively through discourse" (CW, 11). representation and the real, and posit meaning as emerging at the level of the <sup>27</sup> As Haines and Littler explain: "Drawing more on Spinoza than on the Kan Deleuze than by Lacan, these theorists challenge the absolute boundary between tian tradition informing much post-structuralist thought, and more influenced by
- 28 Barad, Meeting the Universe Halfway, 64
- <sup>29</sup> Gisela Brinker-Gabler, "Exile, Immigrant, Re/Unified: Writing (East) Postuni-Smith (Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1997), 265. Immigration in Contemporary Europe, ed. Gisela Brinker-Gabler and Sidonie fication Identity in Germany," in Writing New Identities: Gender, Nation, and
- in Uprootings/Regroundings: Questions of Home and Migration, ed. Sara Ahmed 30 Sara Ahmed, Claudia Castañeda, Anne-Marie Fortier, and Mimi Sheller Claudia Castañeda, Anne-Marie Fortier, and Mimi Sheller (Oxford: Berg, 2003) "Introduction: Uprootings/Regroundings: Questions of Home and Migration,
- UP, 2000), 205 (hereafter cited in text as H). 31 Elizabeth Boa and Rachel Palfreyman, Heimat — A German Dream: Regional Loyalties and National Identity in German Culture 1890–1990 (Oxford: Oxford
- 32 Sara Ahmed, Strange Encounters: Embodied Others in Post-Coloniality (London: ity (T, 78). not engaged in metaphorization, being in fact concerned with singularity, specific Routledge, 2000), 82 (hereafter cited in text as SE). Braidotti herself claims she is
- On Female Body Experience: "Throwing Like a Girl" and Other Essays (Oxford Oxford UP, 2005), 123 (herafter cited in text as FB). 33 Iris Marion Young, "House and Home: Feminist Variations on a Theme," in
- to each other." Civizenship and the Ethics of Care: Feminist Considerations on Jus the fact that subjects are different and in this sense both 'strange' and 'knowable' on to postmodernism . . . has the capacity to deal with diversity and alterity, with 34 Selma Sevenhuijsen argues, in this connection: "a feminist ethics of care grafted tice, Morality, and Politics (London: Routledge, 1998), 60.

 $^{36}$  Compare with Braidotti: "The point is to radicalize the universal, not to get rid of it" (NS, 204).

37 Tronto, Moral Boundaries, 2.

<sup>38</sup> Judith Butler, Giving an Account of Oneself (New York: Fordham UP, 2005), 28 (hereafter cited in text as GA).

39 Steven Shankman, Other Others: Levinas, Literature, Transcultural Studies (New York: State U of New York P, 2010), 15.

<sup>40</sup> See Benedict Anderson, Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism (London: Verso, 1983), 14 (hereafter cited in text as IC). See also Eric Hobsbawm, Nations and Nationalism since 1780: Programme, Myth, Reality (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992), 5.

<sup>41</sup> Mary Fulbrook, German National Identity after the Holocaust (Cambridge Polity Press, 1999), 203.

42 Anderson, Imagined Communities, 15.

43 See Ernest Gellner, Nations and Nationalism (Oxford: Blackwell, 2006), 6; and Hobsbawm, Nations and Nationalism, 8.

44 Fulbrook, German National Identity, 17.

45 Anderson, Imagined Communities, 16.

<sup>46</sup> Craig Calhoun, Nationalism (Buckingham: Open UP, 1997), 2. Compare with Anderson, Imaginual Communities: "nation-ness is the most universally legitimate value in the political life of our time" (12). On the relationship between nationalism and nation, see Gellner, Nations and Nationalism: "It is nationalism which engenders nations, and not the other way around" (54).

<sup>47</sup> Celia Applegate, A Nation of Provincials: The German Idea of Heimat (Berkeley: U of California P, 1990), ix (hereafter cited in text as NP). Hobsbawm explains that national movements harnessed preexisting variants of feelings of collective belonging to generate their power (Nations and Nationalism, 46).

48 Compare with Gellner, Nations and Nationalism, 55.

<sup>49</sup> Stephen Brockmann, *Literature and German Reunification* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1999), 19 (hereafter cited in text as *LG*).

<sup>50</sup> Julia Kristeva, "What of Tomorrow's Nation?," in Nations without Nationalism, trans. Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia UP, 1993), 46 (hereafter cited in text as "WT").

51 Hobsbawm, Nations and Nationalism, 192.

<sup>52</sup> Leslie A. Adelson, The Turkish Turn in Contemporary German Literature: Toward a New Critical Grammar of Migration (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), 11.

53 Fulbrook, German National Identity, 7.

<sup>54</sup> On the legacy of national socialism, see Anne Fuchs, Phantoms of War in Contemporary German Literature, Films and Discourse: The Politics of Memory (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008); and Anne Fuchs and Mary Cosgrove,

> Monteath and Reinhard Alter, Introduction to Rewriting the German Past: His art Taberner and Frank Finlay (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2002); and Perer German Identity: Culture, Politics, and Literature in the Berlin Republic, ed. Stuton, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2004); Stuart Taberner, Introduction to Recusting and Paul Cooke (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2006); Olaf Kuhlke, Represent ature into the Twenty-First Century: Beyond Normalization, ed. Steart\_Taberner 68), ed. Renate Rechtien and Karoline von Oppen (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2007) and Barbara John, "German Immigration Policy --- Past, Present, and Future," in tory and Identity in the New Germany, ed. Reinhard Alter and Peter Monteath ing German Identity in the New Berlin Republic: Body, Nation, and Place (Lewis Helmut Kohl's Vision Been Realized?," in German Culture, Politics, and Liter-York: Routledge, 2001). On globalization, see Smart Taberner, "Introduction: (New Jersey: Humanities Press, 1997). On the Berlin Republic, see also Stephen Brockmann, "'Normalization': Has of Globalisation, ed. Stuart Taberner (Birmingham: Birmingham UP, 2004); and German Literature in the Age of Globalisation," in German Literature in the Age A New Germany in a New Europe, ed. Todd Herzog and Sander L. Gilman (New соитя чине 1990, ed. Anne Fuchs, Mary Cosgrove, and George Grote (Rochester in German Memory Contests: The Quest for Identity in Literature, Film, and Dis Karoline von Oppen, Introduction to Local/Global Narratives (German Monitor German Settlement: Cosmopolite Fictions (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2007); (Oxford: Berg, 2005). On multiculturalism, see Tom Cheesman, Novels of Turkish Representing East Germany since Unification: From Colonization to Nostalgia NY: Camden House, 2006). On reunification and its effects, see Paul Cooke "Introduction: Germany's Memory Contests and the Management of the Past,

<sup>55</sup> See here Fuchs and Cosgrove, "Introduction," 5.

<sup>56</sup> Peter Blickle, Heimar: A Critical Theory of the German Idea of Homeland (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2002), 1, 4 (hereafter cited in text as H).

57 Blickle, Heimat, 17; Boa and Palfreyman, Heimat, 23.

<sup>58</sup> For as Judith Halberstam and Ira Livingston observe, the other is "the matrix against which the self is made to appear and from which it can never be extricated." "Introduction: Posthuman Bodies," in *Posthuman Bodies*, ed. Judith Halberstam and Ira Livingston (Bloomington: Indiana UP, 1995), 5.

<sup>59</sup> Andrew Plowman uses the term the "shock of globalization." In "'Was will ich denn als Westdeutscher erzählen?': The 'Old' West and Globalisation in Recent German Prose," in Tabetner, German Literature in the Age of Globalisation, 48. See here Boa and Palfreyman, Heimat, 194; see also Kuhlke, Representing German Identity, 10–11.

<sup>60</sup> See David Clarke, "Introduction: Place in Literature," in The Politics of Place in Post-War Germany: Essays in Literary Criticism, ed. David Clarke and Renate Rechtien (Lampeter: Edwin Mellen Press, 2009), 18.

61 Andreas Huyssen, Twilight Memories: Marking Time in a Culture of Annusia (New York: Routledge, 1995), 71.

<sup>62</sup> Sander L. Gilman, Introduction to America in the Eyes of the Germans. An Essay on Anti-Americanism, by Dan Diner (Princeton: Markus Wiener, 1996), xviii.

- ture of the 1980s and 1990s (Montreal: McGill-Queen's UP, 2001), 116. in transition" in Repriting Germany from the Margins: "Other" German Litera-63 Fuchs, Plumtoms of War, 204. Petra Fachinger also views Germany as a "society
- 64 On the term "memory contests," see Fuchs and Cosgrove, "Introduction."
- 65 Peter Utgaard, Remembering and Forgetting Nazism: Education, National Identity and the Victim Myth in Postwar Austria (New York: Berghahn, 2003)
- bulization, ed. Frederic Jameson and Masao Miyoshi (Durham: Duke UP, 1998) 66 Roland Robertson quoted in Frederic Jameson, Preface to The Cultures of Glo
- 67 von Oppen, Introduction to Local/Global Narratives, 2.
- 68 Alexandra Kogl, Strange Places: The Political Potentials and Perils of Everyday Spaces (Lanham, MI: Lexington Books, 2008), 8.
- 69 Adelson, Turkish Turn, 172.
- ity, sexuality, and so on places, and is always defined by such factors as age, class, gender, disability or abil long-term experiences, or involve a back-and-forth movement between two 70 The term "migrant" needs careful handling. Migration can denote short- or
- deutschspruchigen Ersählliteratur von Autoren nichtdeutscher Herkunft (Munich 71 See, for example, Mary Howard, ed., Interhalturelle Konfigurationen. Zun
- 72 See here Cheesman, Novels.
- 73 Sara Ahmed, Queer Phenomenology: Orientations, Objects, Others (Durham: Duke UP, 2006), 9, 7.
- 74 Brinker-Gabler, "Exile, Immigrant, Re/Unified," 266
- 75 Homi K. Bhabha, The Location of Culture (New York: Routledge, 2004), 2 See also Brinker-Gabler, "Exile, Immigrant, Re/Unified," 264.
- 76 Adelson, Turkish Turn, 3-4
- if and only if they recognize each other as belonging to the same nation" (7). The 77 See also Gellner, Nations and Nationalism: "Two men are of the same nation same presumably goes for two women.
- eas" (London: Penguin, 1993), 234. 78 Virginia Woolf, "Three Guineas," in "A Room of One's Own" and "Three Guin
- Moallem (Durham: Duke UP, 1999), 1, 12. Women and Nation," in Between Women and Nation: Nationalisms, Transna-79 Norma Alarcón, Caren Kaplan, and Minoo Moallem, "Introduction: Between tional Feminisms, and the State, ed. Norma Alarcón, Caren Kaplan, and Minoc
- 80 Nira Yuval-Davis, Gender and Nation (London: SAGE, 1997), 1.
- 81 See Georgina Paul, Perspectives on Gender in Post-1945 German Literature (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2009), 27 (hereafter cited in text as PG).
- 82 R. W. Connell, Masculinities (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1995), 77. See here Emily Jeremiah, "Touching Distance: Gender, Germanness, and the Gaze in

- Angelina Maccarone's Fremde Haut (2005)," German Life and Letters 64, no. 4
- 83 Claudia Breger, "Hegemony, Marginalization, and Feminine Masculinity: Antje Rávic Strubel's Unter Schnee," Seminar 44, no. 1 (February 2008): 160
- 84 Compare with Connell on masculinity (Masculinities, 33)
- 85 Compare with Alarcón, Kaplan, and Moallem, "Introduction": "Between monoliths and render them more historically nuanced and accountable to poli woman and nation is, perhaps, the space or zone where we can deconstruct these
- was the material from which the German identity was formed, then literature was tität geformt wurde, so war die Literatur der Geist und die Seele" (If language iudicium, 1997), 116: "War die Sprache das Material, aus dem die deutsche Iden-Schreiben in Werken von Özdamar, Özakin und Demirkan," trans. Ditte Stach 86 Brockmann, Literature and German Reunification, 1. See also Dagmar C. G its mind or spirit (Geist) and soul). and Mary Howard, in Interkulturelle Konfigurationen. Zur deutschsprachigen York: Routledge, 2001), 106. Also Elizabeth Boa, "Sprachenverkehr: Hybrides A New Germany in a New Europe, ed. Todd Herzog and Sander L. Gilman (New Lorenz, "Beyond Goethe: Perspectives on Postunification German Literature," in Erzählliteratur von Autoren nichtdentscher Herkunft, ed. Mary Howard (Munich:
- 87 Stephanie Bird, Women Writers and National Identity: Bachmann, Duden Ozdamur (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003), 2.
- tury German Literature: The Challenge of Ecocriticism (Houndmills: Palgrave 88 Axel Goodbody, Nature, Technology and Cultural Change in Twentieth-Cen-Macmillan, 2007), 40.
- 89 Deleuze and Guattari, A Thousand Platzaus, 5.
- <sup>90</sup> Compare with Goodbody: "[Literature's] ambiguity, irony and metaphorical (Nature, Technology and Cultural Change, 40) mentalisation, destabilise ideologies and subvert one-dimensional identities' language free concepts and ideas from their discursive simplification and instru-
- en's Writing in German," in Taberner, German Literature in the Age of Globalisa 91 Beth Linklater, "Germany as Background: Global Concerns in Recent Wom-
- 92 See here Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, "Three Women's Texts and a Critique of Criticism, ed. Catherine Belsey and Jane Moore (Basingsroke: Macmillan, 1989) Imperialism," in The Feminist Reader: Essays in Gender and the Politics of Literary
- Stuart Taberner (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007), 160 Women," in Contemporary German Fiction: Writing in the Berlin Republic, ed. Stuart Taberner (Cambridge: Cambridge: TID 2007). 93 Lyn Marven, "German Literature in the Berlin Republic -- Whiting
- many Today," in Evolving Jewish Identities in German Culture: Borders and Cross-94 Diana Orendi, "The New Expatriates: Three American-Jewish Writers in Ger ings, ed. Linda E. Feldman and Diana Orendi (Wessport, CT: Praeger, 2000)

#### INTRODUCTION

ity, Ethnicity and Gender in the German-Speaking Context (Amsterdam: Rodopi also Barbara Kosta and Helga Kraft, ed., Writing against Boundaries: National in Women's Literature and Art (New York: State U of New York P, 1997). See 95 Karen Jankowsky and Carla Love, ed., Other Germanies: Questioning Identity

and Re-Writing Heimat: Turkish Women Writers in German," in Women in Gernine Writing' in Emine Sevgi Özdamar's Das Leben ist eine Karawawerei," Ger-96 See Sohelia Ghaussy, "Das Vaterland verlassen: Nomadic Language and Femiman Yearbook 13 (1997): 225-43. man Quarterly 27, no. 1 (1999): 1-16. See also Heike Henderson, "Re-Thinking

97 Patricia Herminghouse and Magda Mueller, ed., Gender and Germanness: Cul tural Productions of a Nation (Providence: Berghahn, 1997).

98 Bird, Women Writers and National Identity, 4, 8.

99 Lyn Marven, Body and Narrative in Contemporary Literatures in German Herta Müller, Libnie Moniková, and Kerstin Hensel (Oxford: Clarendon Press

100 Fachinger, Rewriting Germany, xii.

101 J. J. Long, "Monika Maron's Pawels Briefe: Photography, Narrative, and the Claims of Postmemory," in Fuchs, Cosgrove, and Grote, German Memory Con-

Stoffe," in Transitions: Emerging Women Writers in German-Language Literature of Oneself: Materiality, Femininity, and Germanness in Larissa Boehning's Liebte NY: Camden House, 2011), 133-47; and Emily Jeremiah, "Sewing an Account of the Twentieth-First Century, ed. Lyn Marven and Stuart Taberner (Rochester, ture, Germanness, and Globalization," in Emerging German-Language Novelists whose work I discuss elsewhere: Emily Jeremiah, "Sibylle Berg, Die Fahrr: Literadam: Kodopi, 2012), 83-101 (German Monitor), ed. Valeric Heffernan and Gillian Pye (forthcoming, Amster-102 Other possible subjects would have been Sibylle Berg and Larissa Boehning

### Seeing Strangely: Birgit Vanderbeke's Ways of Knowing

What can she know?

Lorraine Code

Being is not only itself, it escapes itself. — Emmanuel Levinas,

"Reality and Its Shadow"

#### Nomadic Knowing

a strange way of knowing. manness and gender. As we will see, her work practices and encourages a prerequisite for an openness to engage with others. The subject's perand Rosi Braidotti implies, a refusal to be fixed and bounded is indeed fore in the work of Birgit Vanderbeke, a writer who also challenges Gerformances are in any case always relational. This insight comes to the cal behaviors alongside, or within, mobility. As the work of Sara Ahmed persist? The "strange subjects" this study explores all in fact assert ethi joyously free and nomadic, how can attachments to others emerge and OSTMODERNISM IS WIDELY UNDERSTOOD to privilege disunity over coherence, leaving morality an uncertain business. If the subject is

skepticism with regard to dominant discourses, and her awareness of the it, it means it's working).3 This wry statement illuminates the writer's from Vanderbeke's Geld oder Leben (Your money or your life, 2003) is challenging and unsertling, as exemplified by the following assertion a travel guide. A volume of essays, interviews, and reviews concerned with operations of power. Her works deal caustically with consumerism and "Wenn alle daran glauben, heißt es, es funktioniert" (If everyone believes man studies, however, her work has received little attention.<sup>2</sup> This work Vanderbeke appeared in Germany in 2001. In Anglo-American Ger-France. She is the author of eleven subsequent novellas, a cookbook, and novella, Das Muschelessen (1990; The Mussel Feast, 2013) received the in Frankfurt am Main, where she later studied law and French. Her first Ingeborg Bachmann Prize. In 1993, Vanderbeke moved to the south of moved with her family to West Germany in 1961. She was brought up Vanderbeke was born in 1956 in Dahme/Mark in the GDR, and